

Issue I-2022

ISSN 2039-0416

SPORTING SUCCESSION IN FOOTBALL

J. Cambreleng Contreras – S. Samarth – J.F Vandellós Alamilla (eds)

Foreword
by
José Juan Pintó and Ulrich Haas

G. Cai – J. Cambreleng Contreras – L. Cassiano Neves – M. Cavaliero – M. Colucci – C. Etter – M. Flores Chemor – V. Garza Valenzuela – A. Graeser – P.J. Greene – M. Hovell – V. Hugo Almeida – L. Kabelskaya – H. Kahlert – Z. Kallimani – A. Liverko – J. López Batet – S. Malvestio – D. Menz – S.M. Moreno – M. Motta – S. Ng – S.P. Spera – H. Paris – P. Pivovarov – A. Reck – S. Samarth – A. Stângaciu – A. Tamayo Iannini – J.F. Vandellós Alamilla – R. Vermeer

2022



TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD	
by <i>José Juan Pintó</i> and <i>Ulrich Haas</i>	13
ABOUT THE AUTHORS	19
ABBREVIATIONS	23

INTRODUCTION

WHO IS GOING TO PAY ME? AND AM I EVER GOING TO GET PAID? A SHORT OVERVIEW OF THE ISSUES RELATED TO INSOLVENCY AND SPORTING SUCCESSION OF FOOTBALL CLUBS	
by <i>Michele Colucci</i>	27

CHAPTER I

WHAT IS A FOOTBALL CLUB?	
by <i>Josep F. Vandellós Alamilla</i>	35
1. Introduction	35
1.1 According to the FIFA Statutes and Regulations	36
1.1.1 The FIFA Statutes	36
1.1.2 The FIFA Regulations	41
1.2 According to the Court of Arbitration for Sport (CAS) jurisprudence ...	42

CHAPTER II

WHAT IS SPORTING SUCCESSION OF A FOOTBALL CLUB?	
by <i>Jaime Cambreleng Contreras</i> , <i>Saksham Samarth</i> and <i>Josep F. Vandellós Alamilla</i>	47
2.1 The Regulation of Sporting Succession	47

2.2	The Rationale Behind Sporting Succession of Football Clubs	56
2.2.1	Promote Contractual Stability	57
2.2.2	Protection of Competitions and/or Level Playing Field	58
2.2.3	Avoid Abusive or Fraudulent Conducts	61
2.2.4	Protecting Creditors from Intransparent Transfers of Assets	63
2.2.5	Interim Conclusion	64
2.3	Most Common Corporate Transactions Behind Sporting Succession of Clubs	65
2.3.1	Recognition of Football Clubs by FIFA and Football Creditors	65
2.3.2	Corporate Structures that Have Led to Sporting Succession	66
2.3.3	Regulatory Changes and Their Possible Impact	67
2.4	Elements to Identify Sporting Succession of Football Clubs	71
2.4.1	Analysis of CAS Jurisprudence Before the Inclusion of the Term Sporting Succession in the 2019 Edition of the FDC	71
2.4.2	Transfer of Federative Rights and its Effect	79
2.4.3	Analysis of CAS Jurisprudence After the 2019 Edition of the FDC Came Into Force	81
2.4.4	Analysis of Subjective Elements – How Does CAS Treat the Element of Fraud and Abuse in Sporting Succession?	84
2.4.5	Interim Conclusion	88
2.5	Is Sporting Succession of Football Clubs Different From Other Types of Legal Succession Such as the Transfer of an Undertaking?	90
2.5.1	Sporting Succession in Football	90
2.5.2	Transfer of Undertakings in National Law (Focus in Swiss and EU Law)	99
2.5.3	Interim Conclusion	105

CHAPTER III

SPORTING SUCCESSION AND PROCEDURAL MATTERS

by *Marc Cavaliero, Jaime Cambreleng Contreras and Carol Etter* 111

3.1	The Parties in Sporting Succession Cases	111
3.1.1	Relationship Between a Club and Its Underlying Legal Entity	111
3.1.2	Concepts of Old Club, New Club and Creditor	114
3.1.3	Who Has To Be Summoned As a Party?	116
3.2	The Applicable Regulations – Ratione Temporis	118
3.3	Limitation Periods in Sporting Succession Cases	124
3.3.1	Horizontal Disputes	124
3.3.2	Vertical Disputes	128
3.3.3	Interim Conclusion	129
3.4	The Res Judicata Effect of the Decisions Passed by the FIFA Deciding Bodies	129
3.4.1	The Principle	129
3.4.2	Principle of Res Judicata is Part of Swiss Public Policy	132
3.4.3	Effects of Decisions Passed by FIFA's Deciding Bodies	132
3.4.4	Extending the res judicata effect of a decision	138

3.5	The Standard of Proof	140
3.5.1	Disciplinary Proceedings	140
3.5.2	Horizontal Proceedings	140
3.6	The Burden of Proof in Sporting Succession Procedures	142
3.7	The Standing to Sue/Appeal and the Standing to be Sued in Sporting Succession Disputes	145
3.7.1	Standing to Sue/Appeal in Sporting Succession Cases	145
3.7.1.1	General Notes on the Issue of Standing to Sue/Appeal	145
3.7.1.2	Does a Judgement Creditor Have Standing to Sue/Appeal Against a Decision Passed by the FIFA Disciplinary Committee?	147
3.7.1.3	Standing to Sue/Appeal in Cases of Sporting Succession in Horizontal Disputes	157
3.7.2	Standing To Be Sued in Sporting Succession Cases	158
3.7.2.1	General Notes on the Issue of Standing To Be Sued	158
3.7.2.2	Standing To Be Sued in Cases of Sporting Succession in Vertical Disputes	161
3.7.2.3	Standing To Be Sued in Cases of Sporting Succession in Horizontal Disputes	163

CHAPTER IV

FINANCIAL AND DISCIPLINARY CONSEQUENCES OF SPORTING SUCCESSION

by <i>Mark Hovell</i>	169	
4.1	Not a Sporting Successor	170
4.2	Where There is a Straightforward Finding of Sporting Succession	171
4.3	Cases Where FIFA DC and CAS Disagree	173
4.4	Additional Considerations	174
4.4.1	Lack of Diligence by the Player	174
4.4.2	Mitigation by the Player	175
4.4.3	Is Article 163 of the Swiss Code of Obligations Relevant?	179
4.4.4	Consequences When Club a Remains in Being	179
4.4.5	Are There Any Benefits That Flow From Being a Sporting Successor?	180
4.5	Conclusion	182

CHAPTER V

SPORTING SUCCESSION AND INSOLVENCY LAW

by <i>Jaime Cambreleng Contreras, Saksham Samarth and Josep F. Vandellós Alamilla</i>	185	
5.1	Insolvency and Sporting Succession of Football Clubs – General Overview	186

5.1.1	Meaning of “Insolvency” from the Perspective of the FIFA Regulations	189
5.1.2	The Recognition of Foreign Insolvency Proceedings in Switzerland	192
5.1.3	Effects of the Insolvency on the Original Claim of the Creditor	194
5.2	What Is Required From The Debtor Club in Cases of Sporting Succession Stemming From Bankruptcy/Insolvency of the Old Club?	199
5.2.1	Informing the Creditor About Opening of the Insolvency/Bankruptcy Proceedings of the Original Club	199
5.2.2	Proving That It Was Theoretically Possible for the Debt To Be Paid in the Insolvency/Bankruptcy Proceedings of the Original Club	203
5.3	What Is Required from a Creditor of an Insolvent Club in the Context of Sporting Succession: The Duty of Diligence	206
5.3.1	General Aspects of a Creditor’s Expected Duty of Diligence	206
5.3.2	Was the Creditor Informed?	208
5.3.2.1	Notification Via Official Means (EU Insolvency Law / National Laws) ...	209
5.3.2.2	Notification Via Non-Official Means (i.e. Through FIFA Proceedings) ...	212
5.3.3	How Far Does The Creditor Have To Go?	216
5.3.4	Is It Enough For The Creditor’s Credit To Be Included Ex Officio in the List of Credits? When a Creditor Is Required To Register the Claim?	220
5.3.5	Interim Conclusion	223

CHAPTER VI

SPORTING SUCCESSION AT NATIONAL LEVEL	227
Argentinian Football Association (“AFA”) by <i>Ariel Reck</i>	227
Brazilian Football Confederation (“CBF”) by <i>Marcos Motta, Stefano Malvestio & Vitor Hugo Almeida</i>	230
Chinese Football Association (“CFA”) by <i>Guo Cai</i>	236
Colombian Football Federation (“FCF”) by <i>Andrés Tamayo Iannini</i>	241
The Football Association (“FA”) by <i>Mark Hovell</i>	245
French Football Federation (“FFF”) by <i>Hugo Paris</i>	252
German Football Association (“DFB”) / German Football League (“DFL”) by <i>Alexander Graeser</i>	257

Hellenic Football Federation (“HFF”) by <i>Zografenia Kallimani</i>	260
All India Football Federation (“AIFF”) by <i>Saksham Samarth</i>	265
Italian Football Federation (“FIGC”) by <i>Saverio Paolo Spera</i>	269
Football Association of Malaysia (“FAM”) by <i>Susanah Ng</i>	276
Mexican Football Federation (“FMF”) by <i>Víctor Garza Valenzuela</i>	280
Portuguese Football Federation (“FPF”) by <i>Luis Cassiano Neves</i>	283
Romanian Football Federation (“FRF”) by <i>Adrian Stângaciu</i>	290
Russian Football Union (“FUR”) by <i>Pavel Pivovarov</i> and <i>Lizaveta Kabelskaya</i>	296
Royal Spanish Football Federation (RFEF) by <i>Jordi López Batet</i>	300
The United States Soccer Federation (“US Soccer”) by <i>Paul J. Greene</i>	306
Uzbekistan Football Association (“UFA”) by <i>Angelina Liverko</i>	310

CHAPTER VII

MOVING FORWARD: CONSTRUCTIVE CRITICISMS AND PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVEMENT IN SPORTING SUCCESSION REGULATIONS by <i>Roy Vermeer</i> and <i>Mario Flores Chemor</i>	319
7.1 FIFPRO’s View	319
7.2 Fundamental Aspects of Sporting Succession and the CAS Power of Review: the Certainty of Uncertainty	323

CHAPTER VIII

SPORTING SUCCESSION IN OTHER SPORTS	339
FIBA (Fédération Internationale de Basketball)	
by <i>Dr. Heiner Kahlert</i> and <i>David Menz</i>	339
8.1 Applicable Regulations	339
8.1.1 Remarks	341
8.1.2 Honouring of BAT Awards	343
8.1.3 Cases of Sporting Succession	346
8.1.4 Lessons Learned from the CAS Jurisprudence	351
8.1.5 Conclusions	352
FIM (Fédération International de Motocyclisme)	
by <i>Sara María Moreno</i>	353
8.2 Applicable Regulations	353
8.2.1 Remarks	354
8.2.2 The Particularities of Sporting Succession Disputes	355
8.2.3 The Involvement of Third Entities in Succession Disputes	356
8.2.4 Conclusions	359

CHAPTER IX

CONCLUSIONS	
by <i>Jaime Cambreleng Contreras</i> , <i>Saksham Samarth</i> and <i>Josep F. Vandellós Alamilla</i>	363
9.1 Future Challenges in Regulating Sporting Succession in Football	363
9.2 Additional Considerations and Open Questions	365
9.3 Final Remarks	368

ANNEX I

CAS JURISPRUDENCE IN CHRONOLOGICAL ORDER	373
--	-----

ANNEX II

SELECTED JURISPRUDENCE BY TOPIC	379
---------------------------------------	-----

ANNEX III

RELEVANT REGULATIONS ON SPORTING SUCCESSION 387

SUBJECT INDEX 391